

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

OFFICE OF THE INDEPENDENT BUDGET ANALYST REPORT

Date Issued: September 20, 2007 IBA Report Number: 07-89

City Council Docket Date: September 24, 2007

Item Number: 202

Subject: Settlement of Binding Arbitration Award in Favor of the San Diego Chargers

OVERVIEW

This item requests authorization to pay the San Diego Chargers an amount not to exceed \$1.98 million to resolve all claims against the City resulting from the Binding Arbitration Award on February 3, 2007 for the 2002, 2003, 2004 and 2005 football seasons. Funds for this action are requested to be transferred from the Unallocated Reserve to the Public Liability Fund for expenditure to the San Diego Chargers.

FISCAL/POLICY DISCUSSION

Binding arbitration was agreed to after the Chargers Football Company LLC demanded to be compensated for present and future lost revenue, due to the loss of seats that resulted after renovation of Qualcomm Stadium in order to comply with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) requirements.

During the Fiscal Year 2008 budget development process, the Mayor identified the need in his May Revision to supplement the budget by \$1.4 million in the Qualcomm Stadium Fund for costs related to payments to the Chargers under this agreement.

Following communication with the City Attorney's office, additional information was provided that was not included in the materials accompanying this action:

- The \$1.4 million payment budgeted in Fiscal Year 2008 is required for the 2006 football season, and is in addition to the \$1.98 million request.
- Payments under the agreement may either be annual or on a per game basis. It
 may be easier to audit for the full year than to do an audit after each game, so an
 annual payment may make economic sense.



• The \$1.98 million payment is comprised of the following annual amounts:

0	2002	\$204,941.87
0	2003	\$165,182.93
0	2004	\$434,598.49
0	2004 post season	\$144,110.74
	2005	\$1,031,505.57

- If the Chargers meet the requirements set forth in the arbitration decision then annual payments may be due as long as (1) the Chargers are in Qualcomm Stadium and/or (2) the configuration of the stadium, i.e. number of seats, remains the same.
- The amount of the future payments is based on a formula approved by the arbitrator, which depends on the percentage of actual seats sold.

Based on discussions with representatives from the City Auditor and Comptroller's Office, it is our understanding that actions to increase appropriations by utilizing funds from the Unallocated Reserve require an amendment to the annual Appropriation Ordinance, and cannot be done by resolution. It is our understanding that an amendment to the Appropriation Ordinance is currently being prepared, and is planned to be provided in advance of the Council meeting.

Additional questions have been raised and answers were not received by the time this report was issued. Council members may wish to ask these questions or others during the Council meeting.

- 1. This action requests funding from the Unallocated Reserve, however the last report from Risk Management on the status of the Public Liability fund shows available funds of \$2.57 million. Can the Public Liability Fund be utilized first, before accessing the Unallocated Reserve?
- 2. Why are payments for past seasons coming from the Public Liability Fund and Reserve Funds, while some payments due under the same agreement are coming from the Qualcomm Stadium Fund?
- 3. Have any estimates been prepared for payments for future years?

CONCLUSION

The IBA believes the proper actions should be taken in a timely manner by the Mayor and City Council to comply with the order of the Superior Court to pay the judgment to the San Diego Chargers. Since additional information on this subject has come to our attention, we felt it would be best to provide it to the City Council and the public, to assist in the review and decision-making process. Additionally, it should be noted that the settlement agreement will have an ongoing fiscal impact, as long as the Chargers remain at Qualcomm Stadium.

Elaine DuVal

Fiscal & Policy Analyst

APPROVED: Andrea Tevlin Independent Budget Analyst

	000345	REQU	JEST FOR CO	I DIEGO	TION		1. CERTIFICATE NUMBER 9/24 (FOR AUDITOR'S USE OI 2800/89;		
то: CITY	ATTORNE	 Y	2. FROM (ORIGINATING CITY ATTOR	•	3. DATE: 9/11/2007				
4. SUBJE		· <u>-</u>	CITATION	INE I				7/11/2	
Settle 5. PRIMA	ement of Bin	ding Arbitrati	on Award in Fa	vor of the Sa	an Die	ego Chargers	IL STA.)	7. CHECK BOX IF	
Andre	w Jones, DCA	(35880) MS 59		Carmen S	andova	al (35834) MS 5	59	COUNCIL IS A	TTACHED
			8.COMPL	ETE FOR ACC	COUNT	ING PURPOSE			
FUND		81140					9. ADDITIO	NAL INFORMATION / EST	MATED COST:
DEPT.		81140							
ORGANIZ	ZATION	3502							
OBJECT	ACCOUNT	4824							
JOB ORD	DÉR	81141							,
C.I.P. NU	MBER								
AMOUNT		\$1,980,339.60			•				
			10	. ROUTING AN	ND API	PROVALS	,		
ROUTE (#)	APPROVING AUTHORITY	APPRO	VALSIGNATURE	DATE	ROUTE (#)	APPROVING AUTHORITY	APPRO	OVAL SIGNATURE	DATE SIGNED
1	ORIGINATING DEPARTMENT	There	ween	9-11-07	8	DEPUTY CHIEF		-1	
2	Kisk Mart		,	9-11-07	9	598A	1 Bus	herry	9/12/07
3	tinancia l	and	y Milolto	9/11/09	10	CITY ATTORNEY	1,00	,	77-1
4	LIAISON OFFICE		1	11:17	11	ORIGINATING DEPARTMENT	1		
5	AUDITOR	Fant No	Mrd	9/11/07		DOCKET COORD:		COUNCIL LIAISON:	
6					√	COUNCIL PRESIDENT	SPOB	CONSENT ADO	PTION
7							REFER TO:	COUNCIL DAT	E 9/24/0
11. PREF	PARATION OF:	_l ⊠ RF	SOLUTION(S)	ORDINA	NCE(S)		GREEMENT(S)	DEED(
Further 3. A the	nd. Authorizing pa City, its agent Authorizing the San Diego Ch	yment from the s and employees c City Auditor ar argers and their	Public Liability Fus, resulting from the attorney of record	nd (81140) the e binding arbit ssue a check ir	sum o ration s	f \$1,980,339.60 ettlement with t	in settlement of the San Diego (of each and every c Chargers. ublic Liability Fun	laim against
	FF RECOMMENDATION TO THE RESOURCE TO THE RESOURCE THE RES								
12. SPEC	IAL CONDITIONS:			,					
COUNCIL DISTRICT(S):									
COMMUNITY AREA(S):									
ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT:									
HOUSING IMPACT:									
<u> </u>	HER ISSUES	<u>}</u> :							
-						-	•		
	•								
									!
									i

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY SHEET

CITY OF SAN DIEGO

DATE ISSUED: REPORT NO:

ATTENTION: COUNCIL PRESIDENT AND CITY COUNCIL

ORIGINATING DEPARTMENT: CITY ATTORNEY

SUBJECT: PAYMENT OF BINDING ARBITRATION AWARD

COUNCIL DISTRICT(S): 6

CONTACT/PHONE NUMBER: ANDREW JONES or CARMEN SANDOVAL

(619) 533-5800

<u>REQUESTED ACTION:</u> Authorizing the Mayor and the City Council to pay the San Diego Chargers (CHARGERS FOOTBALL COMPANY LLC.), a total sum of \$1,980,339.60 in settlement of each and every claim against the City, its agents and employees, resulting from the Binding Arbitration Award on February 3, 2006, for the 2002, 2003, 2004, and 2005 seasons.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approve the resolution

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY: The proposed payment would resolve all claims brought by the San Diego Chargers which were the subject of Binding Arbitration for the 2002, 2003, 2004, and 2005 seasons. Binding arbitration was agreed to after the Chargers Football Company LLC demanded to be compensated for present and future loss revenue, due the loss of seats that resulted after renovation of Qualcomm Stadium in order to comply with ADA requirements. Future payments will depend on the percentage of actual seats sold based on the formula approved by the Arbitrator.

<u>FISCAL CONSIDERATIONS</u>: The Auditor will be authorized to appropriate and transfer \$1,980,339.60 from Unallocated Reserves to the Public Liability Fund. The Arbitration Award will be paid from the Public Liability Fund.

<u>PREVIOUS COUNCIL and/or COMMITTEE ACTION:</u> This item was heard in closed session when authority was obtained to enter into binding arbitration.

COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION AND PUBLIC OUTREACH EFFORTS: NA

KEY STAKEHOLDERS AND PROJECTED IMPACTS: NA

Originating Department

Deputy Chief/Chief Operating Officer

000349

The City of San Diego CERTIFICATE OF CITY AUDITOR AND COMPTROLLER

CERTIFICATE	OF UNALLOTTED BALANCE	A.C.
CERTIFICATE	OF UNALLOTTED BALANCE	AC

		CERTIFICATE OF UNALLOTTED BALANCE AC				2800189						
						•		ORIGINATING	DEPT. NO.:	45		
					uired for the e into the Trea				et forth in	the foregoing resolution is		
Amount	:		<u>.</u>		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	. <u>.</u>	Fund:			 -		
Purpose	e: <u> </u>		,									
Date:			By;									
					AC	COUNTING DATA						
ACCTG. LINE	CY PY	FUND	DEPT	ORG.	ACCOUNT	JOB ORDER	OPERATION ACCOUNT	BENF/ EQUIP	FACILITY	AMOUNT		
.	 											
				·				TOTAL	AMOUNT			
										FUND OVERRIDE		
the purp to come	ose of into the asury, abered	f said contra ne Treasury together v d.	act, that suff t, to the cred	icient mone lit of the ap neys antici	eys to meet the propriation from	e obligations m which the	of said con same are to	tract are actua be drawn, ar	ally in the nd that the	have been appropriated for Treasury, or are anticipated said money now actually in ppropriation, are otherwise		
				<u></u>	,000,000.50			_				
Vendor:		San Diego	Chargers a	nd their atto	rney of record	Charles H. D	ick, Jr and	Abby B. Silver	man, Bak	er & Mckenzie LLP		
Purpose: Authorize the Auditor and Comptroller to appropriate and transfer funds from the Unallocated Reserve to the Public Liability Fund. Authorize payment from the Public Liability Fund resulting from binding arbitration settlement with the San Diego Chargers and to authorize the City Auditor/Comptroller to issue a check to above listed vendor.												
Date:	,		Septemb	er 11, 2007		. Ву:	Sam	AUDITOR AND	COMPTROLL	9/11/01 ER'S DEPARTMENT		
•		· · ·	_ -		AC	COUNTING DATA		<u></u>		 		
ACCTG. LINE	CY PY	FUND	DEPT	ORG.	ACCOUNT	JOB ORDER	OPERATION ACCOUNT	BENF/ EQUIP	FACILITY	AMOUNT		
001	0	100			9544	:				\$1,980,339.60		
	 							<u> </u>	 			
		<u> </u>		1	L		·	TOTAL	AMOUNT	\$1,980,339.60		
AC-361 (RE\	/.2-92)									FUND OVERRIDE		
									AC	2800189		

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA 8 9 COUNTY OF SAN DIEGO 10 CHARGERS FOOTBALL COMPANY, LLC, a Case No. GIC 862953 California limited liability company, 11 PROPOSED] PEREMPTORY WRIT Petitioner. OF MANDATE TO COMPEL 12 RESPONDENT TO PAY JUDGMENT v. 13 The Honorable GERALD R. "JERRY" Dept: 25 14 SANDERS, Mayor and Chief Executive Officer Judge: Hon. Rafael Arreola of the CITY OF SAN DIEGO, a municipal, 15 corporation, 16 Respondent. 17 CITY OF SAN DIEGO, a municipal 18 corporation, 19 Real Party In Interest. 20 21 To the Honorable Gerald R. "Jerry" Sanders, Mayor and Chief Executive Officer of the City of San 22 Diego: 23 WHEREAS Chargers Football Company, LLC, served and filed its noticed motion and verified petition for peremptory writ of mandate, and a hearing was held on August 29, 2007; 24 25 WHEREAS it appears to this court that the Chargers have no other plain, speedy, and 26 adequate remedy in the ordinary course of law; 27 WHEREAS it appears to this court that you have failed to perform your legal duty, as the 28 duly elected Mayor and Chief Executive Officer of the City and pursuant to Government Code

Baker & McKenzie 10; West Broadway, Twelfth Floor San Diego, CA 92101 +1 619 236 1441

section 970.2, to pay the Chargers' Judgment against the City entered in this Court on May 11, 2006; I THEREFORE, you, the Honorable Gerald R. "Jerry" Sanders, are hereby commanded, on behalf of the City, on exhibite November 27, 2007 to: Pay the Judgment, \$1,980,339.60 plus interest from February 3, 2007, to the Chargers. Attest my hand and the seal of this court his 4th day of September, 2007. Michael M. Roddy Clerk - 2 -

101 West Broadway, Twelfth Floor Sun Diego, CA 92101 +1 619 236 1441

2 Clark of the Superior Court 3 AUG 3 1 2007 4 By: J. BELDEN, Deputy 5 6 7 SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA 8 9 COUNTY OF SAN DIEGO 10 CHARGERS FOOTBALL COMPANY, LLC, a Case No. GIC 862953 California limited liability company, 11 PROPESED! ORDER DIRECTING Petitioner. ISSUANCE OF PEREMPTORY WRIT 12 OF MANDATE TO COMPEL RESPONDENT TO PAY JUDGMENT ν, 13 The Honorable GERALD R. "JERRY" 14 SANDERS, Mayor and Chief Executive Officer Dept: Hon, Rafael Arreola of the CITY OF SAN DIEGO, a municipal Judge: 15 corporation. 16 Respondent. 17 CITY OF SAN DIEGO, a municipal 18 corporation, 19 Real Party In Interest. 20 This matter came on regularly for hearing before this court on August 29, 2007 in 21 Department 25 of the San Diego County Superior Court, located at 220 West Broadway, San Diego, 22 23 California, pursuant to the noticed motion and verified petition of Chargers Football Company, LLC. 24 The matter was argued and submitted for decision, the court was fully advised, and the court 25 has directed that an order and a peremptory writ of mandate should issue in the matter; 26 111 27 /// 111 28 Baker & McKenzie 101 West Broadway, Twelfth Floor CASE NO GIC 862953 (PROPOSED) OR DER San Diego, CA 92101 +1 619 236 1441 SDODMS1/679412.1

THEREFORE, it is ordered that: A peremptory writ of mandate issue commanding the Honorable Gerald R. "Jerry" Sanders, Mayor and Chief Executive officer of the City of San Diego, to pay the Chargers' Judgment against the City in the amount of \$1,980,339.60 plus interest from February 3, 2007. Execution of the Writ of Mandate is stayed until November 27, 2007. Judge of the Superior Court -2-

Twelfik Floor Disgo, CA 92101 1 619 236 1441

CASE NO GIC 862953 [PROPOSED] OR DER

202 9/24

(O-2008-31)

ORDINANCE NUMBER O	(NEW	SERIES)
DATE OF FINAL PASSAGE	•	

AN ORDINANCE AMENDING ORDINANCE NO. O-19652 (NEW SERIES) ENTITLED "AN ORDINANCE ADOPTING THE ANNUAL BUDGET FOR THE FISCAL YEAR 2007-2008 AND APPROPRIATING THE NECESSARY MONEY TO OPERATE THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO FOR SAID FISCAL YEAR," BY AUTHORIZING THE AUDITOR AND COMPTROLLER TO APPROPRIATE AND TO TRANSFER UP TO \$1,980,339.60 FROM THE CITY'S GENERAL FUND UNALLOCATED RESERVE TO THE PUBLIC LIABILITY FUND TO PAY AN ARBITRATION SETTLEMENT WITH THE SAN DIEGO CHARGERS

WHEREAS, on July 30, 2007, the City Council adopted an Ordinance No. O-19652 entitled An Ordinance Adopting The Annual Budget For The Fiscal Year 2007-2008 And Appropriating The Necessary Money To Operate The City Of San Diego For Said Fiscal Year [Annual Appropriation Ordinance]; and

WHEREAS, the City and the Chargers Football Company LLC (San Diego Chargers) have settled claims brought by the San Diego Chargers for the 2002, 2003, 2004 and 2005 seasons as a result of renovations to Qualcomm Stadium in order to comply with American with Disabilities Act (42 U.S.C. §12101 et. seq.); and

WHEREAS, the settlement requires that the City pay the Chargers the sum of \$1,980,339.60, and such amount has not been budgeted in the Public Liability Fund; NOW, THEREFORE.

BE IT ORDAINED, by the Council of the City of San Diego, as follows:

Section 1. That the Report of the City Attorney is hereby accepted.

Section 2. That the Auditor and Comptroller is authorized and directed to appropriate and to transfer up to \$1,980,339.60 from the City's General Fund Unallocated Reserved to the Public Liability Fund, and that the Auditor and Comptroller is hereby authorized and directed to pay or cause to be paid such amount to the San Diego Chargers.

Section 2. That a full reading of this ordinance is dispensed with prior to its final passage, a written or printed copy having been available to the City Council and the public a day prior to its final passage.

Section 3. This ordinance is declared to take effect and be in force immediately upon its passage after two (2) public hearings pursuant to the authority contained in Sections 71, 275, and 295 of the Charter of the City of San Diego.

APPROVED: MICHAEL J. AGUIRRE, City Attorney

By

Chief Deputy City Attorney

MDB:bw:jdf 9/20/07

Or.Dept:City Attorney

O-2008-31

I hereby certify that the foregoing Ord Diego, at this meeting of	linance was passed by the Council of the City of San
	ELIZABETH S. MALAND City Clerk
	By Deputy City Clerk
Approved:(date)	JERRY SANDERS, Mayor
Vetoed:(date)	JERRY SANDERS, Mayor